ANTH 4399: Integrated Themes in Anthropology Anthropological perspectives on 'race' and human variation

The aim of this Capstone course is to integrate the different domains in anthropology for an in-depth examination of 'central problems' in anthropology. Few problems are more central and worthy of a Capstone course than the question of how we understand and explain *human biological variation* – a problem that leads to the corollary question of how anthropologists have dealt with the notion of *race*.

In this course we will explore the history and contemporary understanding of human variation, and the concept of 'race,' as seen through the lens of anthropology, its sub-disciplines, and related sciences. Why this perspective? It is because anthropology had the most to do historically with the invention of the race concept and the reification of the supposedly separate "human races."

Yet, over time anthropology has also led efforts to expose the fact that race has no biological basis, but instead exists as a social construct. Still, as anthropologists we should not pat ourselves on the back too much: as a discipline we still have far to go in understanding human variation, and disentangling it and us from its historical roots in race, and the racism that flows from that flawed, centuries-old folk concept.

In successfully completing this course you will be able to:

- Understand and articulate the historical roots of the race concept and the racism at its core
- Be able to explain why race is a social construct, and has no underlying biological reality, though it can have biological consequences such as in health disparities
- Understand how in the age of genomics anthropologists understand human *biocultural* variation and adaptation.

There is a single text for the course, *Race: are we so different?* by Goodman, Moses and Jones (2019), which we'll use principally as background. The readings we'll focus on (and from which your 'talking points' assignments are drawn) are from the primary scholarly and scientific literature, and are posted on Canvas (under Files).

The course format is lecture and discussion: at the outset of each class, I'll provide the background and context for the readings for that day, which we'll then discuss. At the end of each class, I will highlight a few themes or questions to help guide your reading for the following class.

Your responsibilities are threefold:

- 1. To do the assigned **readings** and **participate** in class discussions. To help frame the discussion, you will provide each day in advance of class 2-3 'talking points' from the assigned readings questions, comments, or things that warrant conversation. Your talking points are to be submitted via Canvas by 9 AM the day the readings are scheduled, so I can get a sense before class of topics we'll want to cover in discussion. This comprises 20% of your total grade: all but one of the talking points assignments are worth 2.5 points each, the exception is the February 6th assignment, worth 10 points. The remainder of the 100 points are based on class participation.
- 2. To display your knowledge on **two exams**, which will occur on **March** 7th and **May** 6th (25% each for 50% of your total grade). The final exam is not cumulative.
- 3. Finally, to prepare a **research paper** of no less than 12 and no more than 15 double-spaced pages. The paper must be on a course-related topic, make use of the relevant course material, and be on a topic of mutual agreement this to allow me to get you going on the right path, recommend sources, and help you as needed (30% of your total grade). There are several assignments and deadlines along the way:

- **February 8**: submit your idea (or possible ideas) for your paper topic via Canvas. I'll give you feedback, and suggest some references to help get you started.
- **February 22**: submit your annotated bibliography in proper Bibliographic format with at least ten sources relevant to your topic. Deficient annotated bibliographies will have to be revised and resubmitted.
- April 4: Optional: submit a draft of your paper, which will be reviewed and returned with comments and suggestions on matters of content, sources, and format. It will not be graded suggestions come free of charge.
- April 25: submit your final paper. This final version will be graded. Late papers will be penalized a ½ letter grade each day they are late.

More information can be found on Canvas (Research Paper Materials).

The relative weight of the work in calculating your grade will be as follows:

Requirement	%	Points	Sum of points	Grade ¹
Class participation and talking points	20%	100 points	450-500 points	A
Exam I	25%	125 points	400-449 points	В
Exam II	25%	125 points	350-399 points	C
Research paper (125 points) + Annotated	30%	150 points	300-349 points	D
bibliography (25 points)		•	<299 points	F
Total	100%	500 points	_	

My policy on missed exams is to give a make-up if the absence was unavoidable. A note from the SMU Health Center, your doctor, or advisor (as appropriate) is required.

Students who need academic accommodations for a disability must first register with Disability Accommodations & Success Strategies (DASS). Students can call 214-768-1470 or visit smu.edu/DASS to begin the process. Once you are registered and approved, submit your DASS Accommodation Letter through the electronic portal, DASS Link, and then communicate directly with me to make any appropriate arrangements. Please note that accommodations are not retroactive, but rather require advance notice in order to implement.

For anticipated absences (religious observance or officially sanctioned and scheduled University extracurricular activities), just let me know in advance, and we can discuss acceptable ways of making up any work missed because of the absence.

See Canvas Simple Syllabus for details of other accommodations.

Students are expected to embrace and uphold the <u>SMU Honor Code</u>. Violations will be acted upon in accordance with the policies and procedures in the <u>Mustang Student Handbook</u>. The use of *any* form of Generative AI is not permitted in this course.

My office hours are Th 2:00-4:00 PM, but it is not a problem if you need to see me at another time during the week – I am almost always around. You are welcome to stop by, please email (<u>dmeltzer@smu.edu</u>) or call (214 768-2826) in advance, as that will insure I will be there. Please pay attention to your SMU email, as that and Canvas announcements will be the means by which I will contact you.

Please put your cell phones on silent or turn them off when you get to class.

ANTH 4399

¹ With a plus [+] or minus [-] assigned to the top/bottom 10 points of the A-D range

Schedule, topics and readings

Week	CLASS	TOPICS AND READINGS:
1.2	January 18 (Thursday)	 Course introduction & Setting the historical stage Goodman, A. et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? (Chapter 1 'Introducing race, human variation, and racism,' Chapter 2 'Inventing race', Chapter 3 'Creating race')
2.1	January 23 (Tuesday)	 Categorizing and classifying human variation Buffon, G. (1749) The geographical and cultural distribution of mankind (selection from <i>A natural history, general and particular</i>, in Eze [1997], Chapter 2). Blumenbach, J. (1776) On the five principal varieties of mankind (selection from <i>On the natural variety of mankind</i>, in Eze [1997], Chapter 6). Jefferson, T. (1785) <i>Notes on the State of Virginia</i> (sections on Indians, and Slaves & Slavery) Banneker, B. to T. Jefferson, August 19, 1791
2.2	January 25 (Thursday)	The 'vexed question' of human unity Goodman, A. et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? (Chapter 4 'Human mismeasure') Prichard, I. (1812) Researches into the physical history of markind (Chapter 5)
		 Prichard, J. (1813) Researches into the physical history of mankind (Chapter 5) Morton, S. (1839) Crania Americana; or, a comparative view of the skulls of various aboriginal nations of North and South America, to which is prefixed an essay on the varieties of the human species. Philadelphia, J. Dobson ('Introductory essay', 'Anatomical measurements' – note these are separate files on Canvas) Morton, S. (1847) Hybridity in animals, considered in reference to the question of the unity of the human species. American Journal of Science 3:203-212. Prichard, J. (1847) Researches into the physical history of mankind, Volume 5 ('Note on the Biblical chronology')
3.1	January 30 (Tuesday)	 The Monogenesis / Polygenesis debate Agassiz, L. (1854) Sketch of the natural provinces of the animal world and their relation to the different types of man. In <i>Types of mankind</i> pp. lviii-lxxviii. Nott, J. and G. Gliddon (1854) <i>Types of mankind or Ethnological researches based upon the ancient monuments, paintings, sculptures, and crania of races, and upon their natural, geographical, philological and Biblical history</i> ('Introduction,' Chapters 1, 2 and 13; these are long chapters so focus on pages 52-61; 80-87; and 450-465) Douglass, F. (1854) <i>The claims of the Negro ethnologically considered</i>. Lee, Mann & Co., Rochester.
3.2	February 1 (Thursday)	 Challenging notions of types and immutability Darwin, C. (1859) On the origin of species by means of natural selection (Chapter 2 'Variation under nature'; Chapter 3 'Struggle for existence'; Chapter 4 'Natural selection'; Chapter 14 'Recapitulation and conclusion') Gray, A. (1860) Darwin on the origin of species. The Atlantic
4.1	February 6 (Tuesday)	 Class will not meet (DJM will be in California), but there is a brief essay assignment on the readings for this date on the topic of Darwin on 'race' and human evolution: Darwin, C. (1871) The descent of man, and selection in relation to sex (Chapter 7 'On the races of man'; Chapter 21 'General summary and conclusions') Fuentes, A. (2021) The 'Descent of man' 150 years on. Science 372:769. Letters to Science in response to Fuentes (2021) Science

4.0	F.1 0	TY ON I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I
4.2	February 8 (Thursday)	 Views of the origins, ancestry, and type(s) of Native Americans Boas, F. (1894) The anthropology of the North American Indian. In <i>Memoirs of the International Congress of Anthropology</i> Brinton, D. (1888) On the alleged Mongoloid affinities of the American race. <i>Science</i> 12:121-123. Hooton, E. (1937) Aboriginal racial types in America. In <i>Apes, men and morons</i> (Chapter 13). Hrdlička, A. (1926) The race and antiquity of the American Indian. <i>Scientific American</i> 135:7-9. Ten Kate, H. (1888) On the alleged Mongolian affinities of the American race: a reply to Dr. Daniel G. Brinton. <i>Science</i> 12:227-228.
5.1	February 13 (Tuesday)	 When biological race met cultural relativism: a Boas retrospective Boas, F. (1894) Human faculty as determined by race. <i>Proceedings of the American Association for the Advancement of Science</i> 43:301-327. (Read pages 307-317 only) Boas, F. (1899a) Some recent criticisms of physical anthropology. <i>American Anthropologist</i> 1:98-106. Boas, F. (1899b) The cephalic index. <i>American Anthropologist</i> 1:448-461. Boas, F. (1909) Race problems in America. <i>Science</i> 29:839-849.
5.2	February 15 (Thursday)	 Immigration: where race and ethnicity converged Goodman, A. et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? (Chapter 5 'Inventing whiteness') Boas, F. (1911) The instability of human types. In Papers on Interracial Problems Communicated to the First Universal Races Congress, G. Spiller, ed., pages 99-103. Boston: Ginn and Co. Grant, M. (1916) The passing of the great race. Scribner's, New York (Chapters 1-2, 4 and 7 are posted – read all) Lodge, H.C. (1891) Lynch law and unrestricted immigration. North American Review 152:602-612. Ripley, W. (1899) The races of Europe: a sociological study. Appleton & Co., New York. (Chapter VI, the first few pages will give you the gist; skim the rest) Ward, R. (1913) The crisis in our immigration policy. Immigration Restriction League
6.1	February 20 (Tuesday)	 If eugenics is the answer, it must have been a terrible question Davenport, C. B. (1917) The effects of race intermingling. Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society 56:364–368. Galton, F. (1904) Eugenics: its definition, scope, and aims. American Journal of Sociology 10:1-25. Holmes, O.W. (1927) 274 U.S. 200. Buck v. Bell, Opinion of the Court. Osborn, H.F. (1934) Birth selection versus birth control. Third International Congress of Eugenics Sanger, M. (1919) Birth control and racial betterment. The Birth Control Review 3(2):11-12. Ward, R. (1910) National eugenics in relation to immigration. The North American Review 192:56-67
6.2	February 22 (Thursday)	 Pushing back against eugenics Boas, F. (1916) Eugenics. The Scientific Monthly 3:471-478 Crew, F. et al (1939) Social biology and population improvement. Nature 144:521-2. Jennings, H. (1924) Heredity and environment. The Scientific Monthly 19:225-238

	1	
		Morgan, T.H. (1925) Evolution and genetics, Chapter 13.
		Pearl, R. (1927) The biology of superiority. <i>The American Mercury</i> 12:257-266
		Nuremberg Trials Project (1947) Brandt Document 51, February 1947
7.1	February 27 (Tuesday)	 Questioning race – we will be joined this day by Mr. Roger Echo-Hawk Boas, F. (1931) Race and progress. Science 74:1-8 Cobb, W.M (1936) Race and runners. Journal of Health & Physical Education 7:1-9. Echo-Hawk, R. (2009) The magic children, Part 5, 'Slowly unraveling' Hooton, E. (1936) Plain statements about race. Science 83:511-513.
7.2	February 29 (Thursday)	 The evolutionary synthesis comes to anthropology Dobzhansky, T. (1944) On species and races of living and fossil man. American Journal of Physical Anthropology 7:251-265 Dobzhansky, T. (1950) Human diversity and adaptation. In Origin and evolution of man. Cold Spring Harbor Symposia on Quantitative Biology, XV:385-400. Montagu, A. (1942) The genetical theory of race, and anthropological method. American Anthropologist 44:369-375. Washburn, S. (1951) The new physical anthropology. Transactions of the New York Academy of Sciences 13:298-304.
8.1	March 5 (Tuesday)	Catch-up and exam review
8.2	March 7 (Thursday)	Midterm exam
9	March 12 & March 14	No class – Spring break
10.1	March 19 (Tuesday)	 Anthropology, evolutionary theory, and race in the Civil Rights Era Allison, (1954) The distribution of the sickle-cell trait in East Africa and elsewhere Transactions of The Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene 48:312–318 Boyd, W.C. (1963) Genetics and the human race. Science 140:1057-1064 Coon, C. (1962) The origin of races. A.A. Knopf, New York. Livingstone, F.B., Dobzhansky, T. (1962) On the non-existence of human races. Current Anthropology. 3(3):279–81. UNESCO Four statements on the race question (read Paris 1950 and 1951 statements) Washburn, S. (1963) The study of race. American Anthropologist 65:521-531.
10.2	March 21 (Thursday)	 Understanding population variation at the genetic level Goodman et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? Chapter 7 ('Race ≠ Human biological variation'); Chapter 10 ('The apportionment of variation')
		 Feldman, M., R. Lewontin, M-C. King (2003) Race: a genetic melting-pot. <i>Nature</i> 424:374–374. Lewis, A. et al (2022) Getting genetic ancestry right for science and society. <i>Science</i> 376:250-253. Mathieson, I. and A. Scally, A (2020) What is ancestry? <i>PLoS Genetics</i> 16(3):e1008624 Tishkoff, S. A. and K. Kidd (2004) Implications of biogeography of human populations for 'race' and medicine. <i>Nature Genetics</i> 36 S21–27.
11.1	March 26 (Tuesday)	Human population history from genomics or why there is no 'racial purity'

		 Goodman et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? Chapter 11 ('The evolution of variation') Adhikari, K. (2017) The genetic diversity of the Americas. Annual Review of Genomics and Human Genetics 18:277-296 Liu, Y. et al. (2021) Insights into human history from the first decade of ancient human genomics. Science 373:1479-1484. Willerslev, E. and D. Meltzer (2021) Peopling of the Americas as inferred from ancient genomics. Nature 594:356-364.
11.2	March 28 (Thursday)	 Was Boas wrong about cranial and anatomical plasticity? Gravlee, C., Bernard, H.R., Leonard, W. (2003a) Heredity, environment, and cranial form: a reanalysis of Boas's immigrant data. American Anthropologist 105:125-138. Gravlee, C., Bernard, H.R., Leonard, W. (2003b) "Changes in Bodily Form": the Immigrant Study, cranial plasticity, and Boas's physical anthropology. American Anthropologist 105, 326–332. Sparks, C. and R.L. Jantz (2002) A reassessment of human cranial plasticity: Boas revisited. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 99:14636–14639. Sparks, C. and R.L. Jantz (2003) Changing times, changing faces: Franz Boas's immigrant study in modern perspective. American Anthropologist 105:323-337.
12.1	April 2 (Tuesday)	 Issues of race and ancestry in forensic anthropology Bethard, J. and E. DiGangi (2020) Letter to the Editor—Moving beyond a Lost Cause: Forensic Anthropology and ancestry estimates in the United States. <i>Journal of Forensic Sciences</i> 65:1791-1792. Ousley, S., R. Jantz and J. Hefner (2018) From Blumenbach to Howells: the slow, painful emergence of theory through race estimation. In <i>Forensic anthropology: theoretical framework and scientific basis</i>, C. Boyd and D. Boyd editors. Stull, K. et al. (2020) Commentary on: Bethard JD, DiGangi EA. Letter to the Editor—Moving beyond a lost cause: Forensic anthropology and ancestry estimates in the United States. <i>Journal of Forensic Sciences</i> 66:417-420. Winburn, A. and B. Algee-Hewitt (2021) Evaluating population affinity estimates in forensic anthropology. <i>Journal of Forensic Sciences</i> 66:1210-1219
12.2	April 4 (Thursday)	 A look at human adaptation and biological variation Goodman et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? Chapter 8 ('Skin deep?'), Chapter 9 ('Sickle cell disease') Balentine, C. and B. Bolnick (2022) Parallel evolution in human populations: a biocultural perspective. Evolutionary Anthropology 31:302-316. Beall, C. (2007) Two routes to functional adaptation: Tibetan and Andean high-altitude natives. PNAS 104:8655-8660 Creanza, N. and M. Feldman (2016) Worldwide genetic and cultural change in human evolution. Current Opinion in Genetics and Development 41:85-92. Jablonski, N. (2021) The evolution of human skin pigmentation involved the interactions of genetic, environmental, and cultural variables. Pigment Cell Melanoma Research 34:707–29. Wilkin, S. (2022) The mystery of early milk consumption in Europe. Nature 608:268-269.

13.1	April 9 (Tuesday)	Why constructs of race and racism matter in medicine – we will be joined this day by Dr. Elizabeth Berk
	(Tuesday)	 Goodman, A. et al. (2019) Race: are we so different? Chapter 12 ('Living with race and racism'), Chapter 16 ('Race and health inequalities')
		• Cerdena, J. et al. (2020) From race-based to race-conscious medicine: how anti-racist uprisings call us to act. <i>The Lancet</i> 396:1125-1128.
		• Gravlee, C. (2009) How race becomes biology: embodiment of social inequality. American Journal of Physical Anthropology 139:47-57.
		• Mulligan, C. (2020) Systemic racism can get under our skin and into our genes <i>American Journal of Physical Anthropology</i> 175:399-405.
		• Silverstein, J. (2015) Genes don't cause racial-health disparities, society does. <i>The Atlantic</i> https://www.theatlantic.com/health/archive/2015/04/genes-dont-cause-racial-health-disparities-society-does/389637/
		• Singer, M. (2016) Culture: the missing link in health research. <i>Social Science & Medicine</i> 170:237-246.
13.2	April 11 (Thursday)	Race in the age of genomics and Genetic Ancestry Testing Blanchard et al. (2019) "We Don't Need a Swab in Our Mouth to Prove Who We
		Are": Identity, Resistance, and Adaptation of Genetic Ancestry Testing among Native American Communities. <i>Current Anthropology</i> 60:637-655. • Feldman (2016) The alt-right and Human Biodiversity:
		https://forward.com/opinion/346533/human-biodiversity-the-pseudoscientific-racism-of-the-alt-right/
		Marks, J. (2019) I coined the phrase "Human biodiversity." Racists stole it. https://anthropomics2.blogspot.com/2019/12/i-coined-phrase-human-html://documents.html
		 biodiversity.html Panofsky, A. et al. (2021) How white nationalists mobilize genetics: From genetic ancestry and human biodiversity to counterscience and metapolitics. <i>American Journal of Physical Anthropology</i> 175:387-398.
		 Reich, D. (2018) How genetics is changing our understanding of 'race.' https://www.nytimes.com/2018/03/23/opinion/sunday/genetics-race.html Kahn, J. et al. (2018) How not to talk about race and genetics [Response to Reich 2018] https://www.buzzfeednews.com/article/bfopinion/race-genetics-david-reich
14.1	April 16 (Tuesday)	 Reckoning with race in the anthropological profession Blakey, M (2021) Understanding racism in physical (biological) anthropology. American Journal of Biological Anthropology 175:316-325.
		 Franklin, M. (2020) The future is now: archaeology and the eradication of anti- blackness. <i>International Journal of Historical Archaeology</i> 24:753-766.
		• Fuentes, A. (2021) Biological anthropology's critical engagement with genomics, evolution, race/racism, and ourselves: Opportunities and challenges to making a difference in the academy and the world. <i>American Journal of Biological Anthropology</i>
		 AAA statement of race (1998): https://www.americananthro.org/ConnectWithAAA/Content.aspx?ItemNumber=2583 AAPA statement on race and racism (2019): https://bioanth.org/about/position-
		statements/aapa-statement-race-and-racism-2019/#:~: text=Race%20does%20not%20provide%20an,types%20or%20racial%20genetic%20 clusters.

	May 6 (Monday)	Final Exam – 11:30 AM – 2:30 PM
15.2	April 25 (Thursday)	No class – DJM in Washington, D.C. – Submit your research paper by 5 PM
		 Wagner, J.K. et al. (2020) Fostering responsible research on ancient DNA. The American Journal of Human Genetics 107:183–195. Harvard holds human remains of 19 likely enslaved individuals, thousands of Native Americans, Draft Report Says: https://www.thecrimson.com/article/2022/6/1/draft-human-remains-report/ Report on black Philadelphians' remains in the Morton skull collection https://prss.sas.upenn.edu/penn-medicines-role/black-philadelphians-samuel-george-morton-cranial-collection Dungca, N. et al. (2023) What we know about the Smithsonian's human remains. https://www.washingtonpost.com/history/interactive/2023/takeaways-smithsonian-human-brains-remains-collection/ (This link will take you to multiple studies ['The Collection'] Be sure to look at 'Revealing the Smithsonian's racial brain collection' and 'The Smithsonian's 'bone doctor' scavenged thousands of body parts,' and 'Former employees say Smithsonian resisted action on human remains')
15.1	April 23 (Tuesday)	 Speaking for/of the dead Bardill, J. et al. (2018) Advancing the ethics of paleogenomics. <i>Science</i> 360:384-385. Cortez, A. et al. (2021) An ethical crisis in ancient DNA research: Insights from the Chaco Canyon controversy as a case study. <i>Journal of Social Archaeology</i> 21:157–178. Dunnavant, J., D. Justinvil, C. Colwell (2021) Craft an African American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act. <i>Nature</i> 593, 337–340. Stantis, C. et al. (2023) Biological anthropology must reassess museum collections for a more ethical future. <i>Nature Ecology and Evolution</i> 7:786–789.
14.2	April 18 (Thursday)	 Bringing the issue close to home: William Willis at SMU Sanday, P. (1998) Skeletons in the anthropological closet: the life work of William Willis, Jr. In <i>African-American pioneers in anthropology</i>, I. Harrison and F. Harrison, eds., pp. 243-264. University of Illinois Press. Wetherington, R. (in preparation) <i>A history of the Department of Anthropology at SMU</i> Chapter 5 – 1969-71: The Period of Turmoil